ISSUES, INFLUENCES, STRATEGIES, AND TACTICS IN STATE CERTIFICATION POLICY DEVELOPMENT

National Art Education Association

National Association of Schools of Art and Design

ISSUES, INFLUENCES, STRATEGIES, AND TACTICS IN STATE CERTIFICATION POLICY DEVELOPMENT

A Joint Working Paper of the

NATIONAL ART EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

and the

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOLS OF ART AND DESIGN

August 1982

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	rag
Preface Organization and Use of This Document Development of the Working Paper Acknowledgements Further Information and Consultation	3 4 5 5 6
Introduction The Role of NAEA in State Certification Policies The Role of NASAD in State Certification Policies	7 8 8
PART I: BASIC CERTIFICATION ISSUES	9
A. Status B. Philosophy C. Policy D. Routes to Certification	9 10 10 10
PART II: INFLUENCES	12
A. Types of Influences B. Developing Priorities	12 13
PART III: STRATEGIES AND TACTICS	14
A. Relationships Among Assessments, Planning, and Evaluation B. Operational Elements C. Time D. Operational Policies E. Sense of Humor	14 14 15 15 15
APPENDIX I: Influences - An Annotated Outline	16
A. Social Influences	16
 The Quality of General Elementary/Secondary Education The National Concept of the Arts Marketing: A Basis of Cultural Generation Arts Advocacy: Propaganda in Service of Marketing Arts Education Advocacy State Control Amelioration of Social Problems Through Elementary/Secondary Education Economics in Education Propaganda Base of Political Activity 	16 17 17 18 19 21 22 22 23

	Page
B. Special Interest Influences	24
1. Individuals and Groups of the General Public	24
2. Professionals in Elementary/Secondary Education	26
3. Professionals in Elementary/Secondary Art/Design and Arts Education	27
4. Professionals in Higher Education	27
5. Accreditation Associations	28
6. State and Local Governmental Units	29
7. Commercial Interests in Elementary/Secondary Education	31
APPENDIX II:	
Strategies and Tactics - An Annotated Outline	32
A Aggaggments	áa
A. Assessments	32
1. Certification Issues and Their Relative Importance	32
2. Process and Sequence of Change	32
3. Influences and Their Relative Importance	32
4. Forming A Management Structure	33
5. Summation and Distillation of the Assessment Process	33
B. Operational Elements	33
1. Testimonial and Operational Policy	33
2. Sequential and Cumulative Strategies	34
3. Style	35
4. Images of Power Versus Real Power	35
5. Information and Involvement for the Basic Constituency	35
6. Dealing with the "Special Interest" Label	36
7. Propaganda Technique	36
8. Propaganda Analysis and Operational Planning	36
9. Assessing Community "Involvement" Techniques	37
10. Targeting the Right People	37
11. Diffusion of Leadership	38
12. Laying the Groundwork for the Next Round	38
ADDIND IN TITLE	
APPENDIX III:	
Sample Basic Operational Plan: Stages Leading to	30
Revised Teacher Certification Requirements	39

PREFACE

The document presented herein is to assist visual artists and educators in the visual arts in developing or preserving an overall framework of state certification policy which permits an appropriate level of professional training in art and art education for the prospective art teacher.

Consideration of this set of issues concerning maintenance of this framework does not interrupt the historic effort of the field to develop and improve the standards of teacher training in art carried out within the framework through a variety of processes in institutions, professional organizations, and accrediting agencies.

This document is not conceived and presented as a policy position of the National Association of Schools of Art and Design or of the National Art Education Association. It is intended only as a resource document for NASAD and NAEA members and others concerned with issue of state certification.

ORGANIZATION AND USE OF THIS DOCUMENT

The sections of the document and their intended uses are as follows:

SECTION	USE
Preface Organization and Use of This Document Development of the Working Paper Acknowledgements Further Information and Consultation Introduction Role of NAEA in State Certification Policies Role of NASAD in State Certification Policies	Explanation of NAEA/NASAD Project on State Certification
Part I: Basic Certification Issues Part II: Influences Part III: Strategies and Tactics	Overview of State Certification Policy Development
Appendix I: Influences - Annotated Outline Appendix II: Strategies & Tactics - Annotated Outline	Specific Evaluation Instruments and Operational Suggestions for Participation in Policy Development by State Groups
Appendix III: Sample Operational Plan	Example

DEVELOPMENT OF THE WORKING PAPER

The principal text of this working paper is based upon a document prepared for the National Association of Schools of Music and reviewed at its Annual Meeting in November 1981.

Text changes were proposed by NASAD and NAEA staff and reviewed by appropriate authorities of both organizations.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

NASAD and NAEA wish to thank the drafters of the source document: Charles Ball, University of Tennessee at Knoxville; Donald Corbett, Wichita State University; Eunice Meske, University of Wisconsin - Madison; Robert Thayer, State University College (New York) at Potsdam; George Umberson, Arizona State University; Robert Wermuth, University of South Alabama; and Samuel Hope, NASM.

The associations also express appreciation to Willa Shaffer, Staff Associate, NASAD, who prepared the text for publication.

FURTHER INFORMATION AND CONSULTATION

For further information and consultation, contact the National Offices of NAEA and/or NASAD.

NATIONAL ART EDUCATION ASSOCIATION 1916 Association Drive Reston, Virginia 22091

Phone: (703) 860-8000

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOLS OF ART AND DESIGN 11250 Roger Bacon Drive, #5 Reston, Virginia 22090

Phone: (703) 437-0700

INTRODUCTION

The issue of state certification for elementary/secondary visual arts specialists and general classroom teachers has developed as a critical concern of many visual artists in the education community during the last five years. The results of proposals on this issue in some states threaten to vitiate the visual arts component of the curriculum to the point that prospective visual arts teachers may have insufficient artistic competence to carry out their teaching duties. Other states may have certification policies which need to be strengthened in support of better prepared teaching personnel. Whatever the situation, it is clear that state certification policies have wide ramifications for the cultural fabric of the nation.

While requests for assistance most often focus on what action should be taken, it is clear that analysis and assessment of the local situation must be intensive, thorough, and sophisticated before workable and effective action plans can be drafted. This is so because both organizational and philosophical conditions vary widely among the states. While the same elements may be present in each situation, those elements will appear in different proportions. These conditions must be taken into account in the formulation of strategy and tactics.

State certification policy development is primarily a political process, despite the qualitative considerations surrounding its discussion. Thus, the rationality of an argument is insufficient for its acceptance as policy. Effectiveness depends upon casting such rationality in political terms.

THE ROLE OF NAEA IN STATE CERTIFICATION POLICIES

As a national organization of professional teachers of art, NAEA works in support of professionals in the states whose primary concerns are focused on the teaching of art in elementary and secondary schools, including teacher education in colleges and universities. In carrying out these responsibilities, NAEA provides continuous information exchange concerning state certification.

Specific involvement of NAEA in state certification policy development comes after invitations from appropriate parties in the state. This may include such entities as state and local school boards, state affiliates of NAEA, parents groups, and legislative bodies concerned with educational policy.

NAEA maintains recommended standards and guidelines useful to all parties considering state certification policies.

THE ROLE OF NASAD IN STATE CERTIFICATION POLICIES

As a national, professional accrediting agency, NASAD cannot insert itself unilaterally into state policy developments. Therefore, the NASAD role must be circumscribed as one of service to professionals in the states who are in the forefront of the effort to develop or maintain quality art and design education curricula at the postsecondary level. Any NASAD involvement must be at the invitation of professionals within the state and be structured to maintain a consultative, service-oriented posture.

NASAD's role is clear, however, in the application of national accreditation standards in specific institutional cases. Unless these standards are changed through procedures outlined in the NASAD Bylaws, the Commissions have no choice but to apply the standards as published in the NASAD Handbook.

PART I

BASIC CERTIFICATION ISSUES

Some readers of this document will already be faced with the reality of changes in state certification requirements while others will be seeking to lead reforms of present policies which are deemed inadequate for the preparation of art/design teachers. Still others fear the prospect of change during the immediate future.

Whatever the operational situation, the most basic question is the relationship between state certification requirements and the preparation of competent and effective teachers of art and design.

The materials presented below and in the remainder of this document focus on means which may be used to achieve the best possible state certification requirements under whatever conditions of policy review present in any particular state.

A. STATUS

Some assessment must be made concerning the status of specific state certification requirements.

- 1. When was the last major review of state certification policies?
- 2. Is a review scheduled? If so, when?
- 3. What are the forces which can generate the "necessity" for review? Analyze local, state, and national influences.
- 4. What are the procedures for review? Are they statutory? Are they ad hoc? Who determines procedures? Who has oversight responsibilities?
- 5. Are those concerned about certification standards in art/design in a proactive or reactive position with respect to the review?
- 6. Is there evidence of political or media agitation which may result in a state certification policy review in the future? What are the principal sources of this activity?

B. PHILOSOPHY

General philosophical belief, however generated, provides the base for policy-making. Depending on philosophical positions, influential individuals and groups at the local, state, and national levels may respond differently to the role of arts education in the schools.

Assessment Question

- 1. How do each of the major influence groups answer the following questions?
 - a. Should the arts be taught in the public schools?
 - b. How should they be taught -- as basic education, as electives for the gifted and interested, both?
 - c. Who should teach the arts -- arts specialists, visiting artists, general classroom teachers, national media presentations, a combination? In what proportion? What priorities if all are not available?
 - d. Should arts teaching have its base in performance skills or appreciation? Should both be present, in what proportion? What priorities if both are not available?

C. POLICY

Basic current and projected educational and curricular policies are essential pieces of operational intelligence and directly affect state certification requirements.

Assessment Questions

- 1. What are the present/proposed certification requirements (a) for the general classroom teacher (b) for art/design and arts specialist teachers?
- What are the relationships of (a) and (b) above to articulation of a "state policy about education in the arts?" What are the likely effects of such articulation at the local school board level?

D. ROUTES TO CERTIFICATION

There are various routes to certification which often influence the specifics of certification requirements. Some common approaches are:

1. Routes to Initial State Certification

- (a) State certifies individual upon recommendation of institution with state approved curricular program.
- (b) State certifies individual on the basis of transcript.
- (c) State certifies individual based upon proof of competency through examination.
- (d) Combinations of (a), (b), and (c) above.

2. Extensions or Expansions of Certification

- (a) Permanent certification is extended based upon years of service.
- (b) Permanent certification is extended based upon achievement of advanced degree.
- (c) Requirements for renewal of certification are dependent on additional study.
- (d) Certification is expanded to other teaching fields through endorsements for additional work.

- 1. What routes to certification are available in the state?
- 2. What is the role of such certification and recertification mechanisms as experiential credits, continuing education units, teacher learning centers, in-service training, etc?
- 3. What are the ramifications of approved routes on visual arts requirements for (a) art specialists (b) general classroom teachers?
- 4. What are the roles accorded to higher education in determining approved routes? Are these strategic and/or tactical roles?
- 5. Are institutions of higher education able to maintain institutional differences under the methods in use or proposed?
- 6. What is the faculty role in determining curricular content under the routes in use or proposed?

PART II

INFLUENCES

State certification policy development will be influenced by a wide variety of philosophies, events, groups, and personalities.

No situation will be the same. Each state group will find a mix of influences unique to itself. In order to develop specific action plans, each state group will need accurate assessments concerning the relative importance of these influences.

One mechanism for generating this assessment is provided in Appendix I.

A. TYPES OF INFLUENCES

1. Social Influences

All policy discussion takes place in contexts influenced by broad social questions. Such issues as "back to basics," the mass culture/ mass marketing connection, and the role of governments in curricular policy both affect and transcend discussion of specific state certification policies. Such connections may be direct or indirect. In some cases, they may not be present.

For an annotated outline of social influences including assessment questions, see Appendix I, section A, items 1-9.

2. Special Interest Influences

Influences tied to the interests of specific groups are part of every policy development process. Groups concerned with an issue are often going down the same road in different directions, yet coalitions which reach agreement on policy can often have decisive results. Special interest groups must be identified and assessed in preparation for action. Assessments must include thorough evaluation of the philosophical position of the group and its history of involvement in state certification policy. These assessments are most critical when coalition activity is contemplated.

It is also important to understand thoroughly the positions of those who may be in opposition. The validity of their arguments as these will be perceived by decision-makers must be carefully studied as one basis for counterproposals.

For an annotated outline of special interest influences including assessment questions, see Appendix I, section B, items 1-7.

B. DEVELOPING PRIORITIES

In making assessments by using Appendix I or by other means, priorities must be set concerning approaches to various influences. The following questions may be useful in this regard:

- (1) based on our mission and objectives, what things can we influence that are critical to us;
- (2) among these things, what degree of influence can we reasonably expect to have and in what sectors;
- (3) what groups or individuals can be expected to assist us, is coalition activity possible or desirable;
- (4) what things over which we have little influence must we be prepared to cope with;
- (5) what non-crucial areas should we be involved in for image reasons;
- (6) among all these things, what degree of involvement is reasonable, given our resources?

PART III

STRATEGIES AND TACTICS

Assessments are in preparation for action of some kind. However, between assessment and action comes strategic and tactical planning. Such planning, based on accurate assessment, is the key to effectiveness in policy development.

A. RELATIONSHIPS AMONG ASSESSMENTS, PLANNING, AND EVALUATION

Several assessments must be made in addition to those concerning influences. Such questions as the process and sequence of change and the formation of a management structure need special attention. Some final written summation or distillation of assessments may be useful as a basis for planning.

When strategies (defined as principal means to ends) and tactics (defined as means to accomplish strategies) have been formulated, these should be assessed for their projected effectiveness and evaluated for their utility from the moment of their implementation.

For further explanation of these relationships and suggested techniques, see Appendix II, section A, items 1-5.

B. OPERATIONAL ELEMENTS

Each state group will use a variety of operational techniques in strategic and tactical plans. Since the Task Force has identified the essential political nature of the state certification policy development process, it is important to make sure that political techniques are thoroughly understood.

Academic politics and state government politics share certain basic characteristics; however, in most cases, there are radical differences which must be taken into account. While the quality and scope of these differences will vary from state to state, any working group ignores these at its own peril. In this regard, such issues as images of power versus real power, dealing with the "special interest" label, and the assessment of "community involvement" techniques deserve careful consideration.

The relationships between propaganda and politics provide another area of operational activity. It is in working directly with these relationships that state certification issues, influences, and strategic/tactical operations often reach their ultimate fusion in policy influence.

For further explanation of operational elements and suggested techniques, see Appendix II, section B, items 1-12.

C. TIME

Time controls much in operational planning; scope, depth, and sophistication among other things. The materials provided in Appendices I and II assume the best possible conditions, including plenty of time. Ideal conditions are rarely available, and time is often the most illusive of ideal conditions. Individuals and groups in positions to propose policy, who can be pro-active, have a distinct advantage over those who must respond. Political tacticians often work to ensure that as little time as possible is available for any sophisticated response from the perceived opposition. This and other timing questions are essential to assessment, planning, operation and evaluation phases of working group activity.

D. OPERATIONAL POLICIES

By conducting their activities, state working groups will begin to develop operational policies. Some discussions will be strategic, others tactical, others related to internal organization and management.

The following simple tests are proposed to assist in the development of operational policy decisions:

- is the decision consistent with goals and objectives; if so or if not, will it be perceived as being consistent; if it will be generally perceived as inconsistent, what effect will this have;
- (2) what conflicts might arise in carrying out the decision, and how serious are these to achieving the objectives of the decision;
- (3) are the resources (financial and otherwise) available to bring the decision to its logical conclusion;
- (4) do we have the personnel required to bring the decision to its logical conclusion in an effective manner;
- (5) where does this decision lie on a scale between a sure thing and a riverboat gamble;
- (6) how easy is it to adjust the decision should external or internal events make it untenable?

E. SENSE OF HUMOR

Many political battles have been won by those who maintain a sense of humor and know how to use it, even in the worst conditions. Don't lose yours. Whether you win or lose, remember the McCullough Pendulum theory: "Get ready to duck, here it comes again."

APPENDIX I: INFLUENCES - AN ANNOTATED OUTLINE

This section outlines philosophical/sociological influences, issues and concepts which are involved in policy action on state certification. These are (1) social influences (2) special interest influences. Some proportional mix of these issues creates the current condition in each specific locale at any given time. Following each section, there is a series of assessment questions which provide examples of information needed as the basis for operational planning.

The first assessment question in every case is whether the particular influence applies significantly to the state situation.

A. SOCIAL INFLUENCES

1. The Quality of General Elementary/Secondary Education

A large number of the voting population, especially parents of schoolage children, have serious concern about quality in education. This concern has resulted in a movement which is often called "back to basics." In the scoreboard mentality which infuses our society, this concern for quality is frequently translated into considerations of test score results. Because of this and other oversimplifications, "back to basics" produces a ready-made political issue which is ripe for exploitation.

The possible ramifications of the "back to basics" movement have alarmed thoughtful educators who see that the aggregate national result might be focus on rote learning of reading, writing, and arithmetic to the avoidance of other curricular programs which encourage thought, reasoned understanding, and sensitivity. In response, such groups as the Council on Basic Education have made clear that basic education involves a broad range of studies including the arts. Such national pronouncements, however, may be ignored at the convenience of those who use the quality of education issue locally for personal political aggrandizement, power redistribution, or both.

- a. By what means is the quality of general elementary/secondary education being addressed for the public at the state and local levels? Is there any widespread concern?
 - (1) Is there a major organized thrust involving the public which uses "back to basics" rhetoric? If so, what does this group or its leaders define as basic?

- (2) How do the media relate to the "quality" issue?
- (3) Is there any particular combination of politicians, citizens groups, media, bureaucrats, educators, etc., which works consistently to define "quality issues" for the public?
- b. How is public rhetoric about quality education being filtered into policy discussions about teacher certification?

2. The National Concept of Art/Design and the Arts

While the sheer quantitative use of the visual arts in our society is probably unprecedented in human history, the preponderance of this use is in secondary or ornamental contexts. A wide range of artistic and expressive forms available are insufficiently known or appreciated. Neither is there massive focus on the development of individual knowledge and skill, which involves understanding and artistic literacy.

Aside from artists whose life work is based in service to the visual arts, it is difficult to find a large number of individuals who understand and support art as a thing in and of itself, who regard art as truly basic to their lives, and who will fight for others to have opportunities for the personal development of artistic understanding.

Assessment Questions

- a. What individuals and/or groups exemplify an holistic understanding of artistic culture in our society?
- b. Do these entities have other commitments that may transcend their artistic ones, i.e. social, political, business, image, etc? Can long-lasting commitment be expected from them?
- c. What is the relative value of these entities in state certification policy discussions?
- d. Under what conditions and in what situations can such entities be most effective?

3. Marketing: A Basis of Cultural Generation

In the twentieth century, the American free enterprise system has learned to rely increasingly on competitive advertising and marketing, and art has come to play an extremely vital role in this development. While this "supportive" use of the visual arts in commercials and advertising is accepted as a reality, it also creates a variety of problems: (1) art is perceived by millions of Americans as only relevant in that commercial context; (2) types of the visual arts rarely so used are perceived as peripheral to society, and as a result art is not regarded as having value in itself; and in turn, connoisseurship and discrimination of quality have little status in our society; (3) furthermore, the overall image generated nationally by these activities does not enhance a general appreciation of the importance, content, and needs of education in the visual arts.

At the same time marketing techniques are used to sell a particular kind of art. These techniques have become primarily associated with manipulating images and exploiting the cult of personalities. Again, many quality arts lose out in the process.

In contemporary marketing -- a highly sophisticated form of propaganda -- the selling of the product is paramount. Whatever the means, very little interest is given to the process that has led to the creation of the product. Creativity and performance skill -- craftsmanship -- are valued less than quantitative salability. The marketing of art is all too often translated into focusing on personalities and on the visual arts as a vehicle for sales rather than as an art form, with its own intrinsic values of pleasure and aesthetic fulfillment.

Another aspect of marketing philosophy has been the linking of arts and leisure; this linking can reinforce the concept of the visual arts as a nonessential frill.

- a. What combination of events, organizations, and cultural forces create the image of "visual arts" for the public at state and local levels?
- b. How many distinctly different public images are there for visual arts in the local situation?
- c. With respect to teacher certification, what is the relative political strength of groups who represent these images?
- d. Can any successful long-term campaign be mounted in support of the image of the visual arts as a serious, basic activity?
- e. How can the use of art for its functional value be complemented with its justification on human and cultural grounds?

4. Arts Advocacy: Propaganda in Service of Marketing

During the recent past much effort has been expended in "advocacy" for the arts. Such efforts are focused on professional presentation and community arts activities. Although this phenomenon is responsible for many good things, the techniques employed tend to focus on increasing public response to that which is designated "art" by some outside authority rather than individual response based on knowledge and understanding.

It is possible that the aura surrounding advocacy efforts can obscure the issue of serious education in the arts by emphasizing marketing technique as a basis of arts involvement. Frequently such efforts work contrary to the case for localized expertise which is dedicated to individual aesthetic development.

While an alliance of arts advocacy and political operations has the potential for increasing tax-supported funding for the arts, it also carries the potential of shifting the focus of policy expertise from the professional sector to the advocacy sector. In such situations, government arts agencies and associated private-sector organizations of non-professionals are developing a strategic role for themselves while delegating to professionals various tactical roles.

The marketing focus of advocacy also raises a set of conditions which produces ever-increasing myopia as each segment of arts presentation separates from the others to preserve the resources thought to be endangered by the marketing efforts of others. This fragmentation of viewpoint can destroy the common base of understanding needed among the presentation, education, and support sectors of the arts.

- a. What is the specific nature of "arts advocacy" in the state or region? Where are its alliances with national networks? What are its major sources of policy suggestion and information?
- b. How closely allied is the arts advocacy effort with the major professional groups involved in presenting the arts?
- c. Are these groups unified or fragmented on policy matters?
- d. Does the "arts advocacy" sector and/or professional presentation groups articulate any position on elementary/secondary arts education? If so, what?
- e. What is the philosophical relationship of such positions to state certification policies? Are these relationships direct or indirect?

Arts in Education Advocacy

During the last few years a particular form of arts advocacy specifically concerned with arts in education has emerged.

The relationship of the professional visual arts education community to this effort varies widely. This arts in education advocacy effort remains based in propaganda technique which attempts to paint a general picture of crisis in order to evoke public response. Such crises are not evoked in a spirit of appreciation for previous work, even as a building base for improvement. Crises are evoked by constantly pointing out the need for major reform.

Some of the major theses frequently advocated by this movement are as follows:

- § No matter what exists, the national needs in arts education are not being met -- the current system is a failure.
- § The first priority is to teach appreciation through the learning about "the arts" rather than being actively involved in the individual arts disciplines.
- § The basic focus should be on general learning about art through presentations by "artists" selected and supplied by an outside agency.
- § Expectation that the general classroom teacher will serve as the primary introducer of "the arts" to all children.
- § An emphasis on the arts as a vehicle for other learning and the primary justification for its inclusion in the curriculum based on such applications.

This movement is not based upon a concept of preservation and expansion. It represents a point of view which is often presented as means of producing viable "arts" programs in elementary/secondary schools. The implication often is that such a program may substitute for an existing program or replace programs which have been cut for lack of funds.

The cumulative effect of arts in education advocacy rhetoric may be to reduce the significance and contribution of curricular programs in visual arts which are already in place and the need to provide professionally competent teachers for their continuation.

Assessment Questions

a. Is there organized "arts in education advocacy" at the state or local level? Is it unified in one group or splintered among many? Where are its alliances with regional or national networks? What are its major sources of policy suggestion and information?

- b. How important are the efforts of arts in education advocates in developing a public image of art/arts education? How does the work of this group or groups relate to public views of quality education?
- c. What is the membership of these arts in education advocacy organizations? Are professional educators in the arts involved? From what sector (professional arts educators or arts in education advocates) does the control come?
- d. What are the relationships between the "arts advocacy" sector and the "arts in education advocacy" sector?
- e. What philosophical positions do the arts in education advocacy groups take on issues which affect state certification?
- f. Do arts educators involved in arts in education advocacy efforts support strong subject-matter based teacher certification requirements?

6. State Control

The current national administration is committed to a policy of reducing direct federal control in many areas and returning more operational authority to the states. The articulation of this policy over time emphasizes the concept of state control in the body politic.

Therefore, we cannot be assured that a lessening of federal control means a lessening of state government control and an emphasis on the concept of local control. There is the possibility of a long period of struggle between those favoring state control and those favoring local control.

- a. What is the general position of your state's administration concerning the degree of state involvement in local decision-making?
- b. Are there trends which signify changes in this position? How is the articulation of federal policy on this question affecting such potential changes?
- c. Are there prominent individuals, groups, or coalitions concerned about the potential intrusion of state regulation in local responsibilities? Do any of these have relationships with the state certification issue?
- d. In what ways are state certification policies and their development connected to the issue of greater state control, especially as related to the concept of national standards?

e. How does the relative emphasis on federal/state/local control relate to tracks for initial teacher certification or renewal of certification, i.e. institutional endorsement or direct application by individuals?

7. Amelioration of Social Problems Through Elementary/Secondary Education

During the last two decades, the nation has been awakened to numerous social problems by the activities of concerned groups. This positive and necessary part of the American policy process has affected elementary/secondary education.

While the appropriate balance of social and academic emphasis in elementary/secondary education will continue to be a matter of concern, the course of policy consideration and the continuing activities of special interest groups often have specific impact on state certification requirements as these relate to the amelioration of identified social needs.

Assessment Questions

- a. What are the primary social problems in the state targeted for specific attention through the elementary/secondary education system?
- b. How do these areas surface and what individuals and groups articulate them? If there is more than one group, are they cooperative or competitive?
- c. What are the relationships of these concepts and groups to state certification policies and policy-making?
- d. Are attempts to deal with social issues through teacher training likely to result in policies adverse to art and art education curricula?

8. Economics In Education

(a) The Elementary/Secondary Teaching Profession

In many locales, remuneration of teachers has not kept pace with inflation and is now well below salary levels for unskilled government workers providing basic services.

This situation has two effects: (1) it provides little financial incentive for excellent students to enter the teaching profession; (2) it drives those committed to teaching to pursue organizational arrangements such as unions and licensure policies which will force a more favorable economic situation. Such organizational arrangements may become factors in state certification policy-making.

(b) Higher Education

Higher education has also been hit hard by fiscal conditions. The resources available to maintain the number of large programs operated in the recent past have diminished due to inflation, declining enrollments, and lack of public support.

In institutions with enrollment-driven funding of schools and departments, maintenance of student credit hour levels becomes critical to the managers of those programs. Declining enrollments in teacher education programs, or fear of same, produces similar concern about credit hours generated.

"Back to basics" rhetoric may provide public rationale for increasing credit hour production in professional education and general studies.

Assessment Questions

- a. What economic issues in education affect state certification policies?
 - 1. elementary/secondary education
 - 2. higher education
- b. Are these issues and relationships discussed publicly or do they remain obscured in other rhetoric?
- c. What is the role of unions in defining economic issues which affect state certification policies?
- d. Is there evidence of overall coordinated planning by any group or coalition of groups for economic improvement purposes at either the elementary/secondary or postsecondary levels? What is their relationship to state certification? Is the relationship direct or indirect?
- e How are the economic goals of various groups pursued in relationship to those of arts and arts education advocates, to those of other economic interests, for example, non-education state and local government personnel? Is the promotion of these efforts unified in any way?

9. Propaganda Base of Political Activity

Irrespective of rational argument, political decisions tend to reflect politicians' perception of what the public understands about any specific issue and how the symbolism of an action will react with that general understanding.

Therefore, in order for decisions to be made without political problems for those in power, public opinion must be prepared to accept the inevitability of action taken, and propaganda technique is often employed to accomplish this.

Since only propaganda can oppose propaganda in a mass public sense, difficulties abound in modifying any condition which has been promoted as reality for some time.

Assessment Questions

- a. What are the primary sources of information for the public about educational issues?
- b. What roles are played by the print and broadcast media?
- c. What approaches and philosophies are expounded in the media which can influence state certification policies directly or indirectly?
- d. How are these approaches and philosophies generated? Are they reactive or proactive? Are there direct connections between the media and certain groups with specific points of view?
- e. Is the information network, media and otherwise, integrated into a propaganda instrument or is there random joining of various philosophical strands supported by value systems with scopes far beyond basic education and/or certification issues?

B. SPECIAL INTEREST INFLUENCES

This section identifies groups which have concern about state certification issues and describes the basic concerns of those groups which may influence policy-making.

1. Individuals and Groups of the General Public

(a) Influential Individuals

Citizens who by virtue of wealth, position, and/or a general perception of their social contribution have direct influence on policy. These individuals are often concerned about a wide variety of issues which affect the welfare of their community.

(b) Parents Organizations

Parents of school-age children are deeply concerned about the "quality" of education. The question then becomes how are such notions of quality generated and influenced.

(c) Arts Advocacy Groups

These organizations seek a rise in involvement in "the arts" in society. Their image generation activities frequently focus on arts personalities and events rather than on works of art themselves or on educational policies which support generation, presentation, or application. This concept emphasizes that education in the arts is achieved by exposure to presentation. Educational institutions then become primarily locales for "professional performance." Arts advocacy groups have called for the removal of certification requirements for "artists" who wish to be employed in the schools.

(d) Arts in Education Advocacy

Allied with arts advocacy and accepting all its notions, some arts in education advocacy groups call for broad based governance (including arts councils) in local development of programs which teach "all the arts to every child." The general classroom teacher's role is often emphasized. While some arts in education advocates admit the tactical utility of the arts specialist teacher, no strategic policy role is envisioned for such teachers. Often the specialist teacher is faulted for his or her alleged interest only in talented students to the exclusion of others.

- a. What are the names of the most prominent individuals exerting significant influence in the state on political processes affecting education and the arts? What are their positions on education and education in the arts? What are the major influences on their thinking? What are their connections with specific interest groups? Are they directly involved in state certification?
- b. What are the names of the major parents' organizations in the state? What is the detailed nature of these organizations? Who generates policy? Do they have positions on certification or which relate to certification?
- c. What are the names of the major arts advocacy organizations? What is their relative operational influence on state education/certification policy? If there is more than one, what are the characteristics of each; are their operations unified, complementary, or competitive?
- d. What are the names of the major arts in education advocacy organizations? What is their relative operational influence on state education/certification policy? If there is more than one organization, what are the characteristics of each? Are their operations unified, complementary, or competitive?

- e. What are the names of other public organizations having operational influences in state education/certification policy? What is their relative influence?
- f. What is the general degree of media coverage accorded to the activities of the above groups? What is their credibility with politicians, public servants, the general public?

2. Professionals in Elementary/Secondary Education

(a) Teacher Organizations

Major concerns are the maintenance and improvement of conditions for effective teaching, the relationship of compensation to effort expended, job security.

(b) Administration Organizations

Major concerns are program security, school image, overall curricular policy, community relations.

(c) Unions

Major concerns are remuneration, job security, and working conditions. There may be some interest in curriculum and professional entry criteria due to job security and economic considerations.

- a. What are the names of the state and local teacher organizations, administration organizations, unions and other organizations of professional general educators at the elementary/secondary level?
- b. How are they related to regional and national organizations and influence networks?
- c. What are their major sources of policy suggestion and information?
- d. Are the state and local organizations unified, complementary, or competitive on state certification issues?
- e. What are their relationships with such groups as parents, arts and arts education advocates, professional arts educators, media?
- f. What is the priority of interests promulgated by these groups? How do these relate to economic issues?

3. Professionals in Elementary/Secondary Music and Arts Education

Professional arts education organizations share concerns with those in other disciplines. These arts organizations and their members will also be concerned that negative changes in state certification will have two principal results. First, the continuity of professional excellence in the discipline will suffer adverse effects which over time will erode the quality of arts teaching in the schools. Second, the philosophical connotations of these changes may filter to the policy development processes of local school boards potentially resulting in budget reductions and program cutbacks which also endanger serious efforts in cultural education.

Assessment Questions

- a. What groups of professionals in art and arts education function at state and local levels?
- b. Are these groups unified, complementary, or competitive in their approach to issues of teacher certification?
- c. Do any of these groups have specific written policies on state certification?
- d. What is the relative political influence of these groups? Through what mechanisms does this influence operate?
- e. What is the impact of these groups with respect to public image of quality education?
- f. What alliances do these groups have with other professional and lay groups in education and the arts? Can these alliances be effective in state certification policy work?

4. Professionals in Higher Education

(a) Teacher Education

Major concerns are the maintenance and improvement of conditions for the effective preparation of teachers, including the maintenance of resources for colleges of education.

(b) General Education

Major concerns are maintaining and enhancing the viability of general studies both within institutions of higher education and in society as a whole including elementary/secondary education.

(c) Education in Art and the Arts

Major concerns are maintaining and enhancing the conditions essential for developing students with competence for work as professionals in the arts. This includes the provision of sufficient resources for the development of both technical and intellectual skills.

Assessment Questions

- a. What are the names of higher education groups and coalitions which focus on the following interests in higher education: (1) teacher education (2) general education (3) education in art and the arts?
- b. How are these related to regional and national organizations and influence networks?
- c. What are their major sources of policy suggestions and information?
- d. Are groups and coalitions within and among the three groupings above unified, complementary, or competitive on state certification issues?
- e. What are their relationships with other influence groups or state agencies?
- f. What is the priority of interests promulgated by these groups? How do these relate to economic issues?

5. Accreditation Associations

Accrediting associations directly involved are NASAD, NCATE, the regional associations, and, possibly, accrediting groups in the other arts. Accreditation is not directly linked to state certification and licensure in the arts disciplines.

To the best of our understanding, the standards of the accrediting agencies do not conflict. NCATE requires attention to guidelines developed by national learned societies and professional associations in the planning of institutional curricula (NCATE Standard 2.4).

In policy discussions on state certification, accreditation is often used by all sides to bolster arguments which may or may not be directly related to the policies of the accrediting association.

The principal issues for accrediting agencies should be the maintenance of national professional standards and the consistent, non-political application of those standards in local situations.

Assessment Questions

- a. What accrediting organizations have standards which relate to state certification issues?
- b. What are the texts of these standards? Are they conflicting in any way?
- c. To what degree are accreditation standards an issue in certification policy formulation? Is the concept of national professional standards respected by the various groups involved in policy development?
- d. Do interpretations of these standards in specific accreditation circumstances contribute to (1) misunderstanding of the real standards statements and/or (2) obfuscation of the role of accreditation?
- e. Is there any statutory link between state certification and accreditation? If so, what is the nature of the link and how does it affect future policy?
- f. What is the real position of state education agency and state school board personnel about (1) regional accreditation (2) specialized accreditation? Does any powerful faction in these organizations seek future broadened accreditation authority for state government? Do they have allies in this from other influence groups?

6. State and Local Governmental Units

(a) State Legislature

Members of the legislature are concerned about the quality of education, but also about the public perception of quality as this relates to re-election and political power.

(b) State Board of Education

This group has extensive power over public education and in most circumstances is the policy generation mechanism. A wide range of issues collide here. Whether the Board is elected or appointed has some bearing on the priorities of various issues.

(c) State Department of Education
(Including State Certification Boards)

Usually the policy and implementing arm of the State Board, issues of concern to the professional staff may be reflected in recommendations to the Board and others. As with many bureaucracies, survival by expansion of influence and authority may be a priority.

(d) Local School Boards

Members of local school boards are a special constituency. As members of the public entrusted with local schools, the combination of public sentiment, teacher and administrator issues, arts and arts education advocacy and all other influences outlined above come together under conditions of direct application. The influence of local school boards on state school boards may vary from locale to locale; however, these connections are matters for serious analysis.

(e) State and Local Arts Councils

Some arts councils are seeking joint authority with state and local education agencies in matters relating to arts education policy development. Others stay quite removed from direct involvement with public education policy. Arts councils serve to promote "the arts." Experience and conditions vary widely concerning the scope of activity accorded to arts councils. Many arts councils have a poor record of consultation with local arts education professionals. Many are well connected with the arts and arts in education advocacy movements. These connections and their ramifications for state certification policy are a serious matter for local analysis.

- a. What are the names of the governmental agencies which influence state certification policies?
- b. What are their relative degrees of influence?
- c. Who are the primary personalities who have operational responsibilities?
- d. Who are the primary personalities who have philosophical influence?
- e. Who are the primary personalities who have ultimate control?

- f. What degree of consonance is there between the views of elected officials and career public servants?
- g. What degree of influence do local school boards have on state certification policy?
- h. Is the relationship between the state education agency and the state arts agency philosophically/operationally unified, complementary, or competitive?

7. Commercial Interests in Elementary/Secondary Education

Vendors and manufacturers of educational materials supportive of the various disciplines will have interest in outcomes of state certification policy development. These interests may be pursued in various ways ranging from support of the activities of professional groups to direct lobbying.

- a. What economic interests of vendors and manufacturers in the state are affected by state certification policies?
- b. What are the names of vendors/manufacturers and organizations of these who stand to lose/gain from state certification policies adverse (a) to the training of visual arts specialists (b) to the inclusion of art/design requirements for general classroom teachers? Do these groups see such connections clearly? Do they have policies and/or action plans in this regard? If so, what is the nature of these?
- c. What is the relative political influence of these vendors/manufacturers and their organizations? Through what mechanisms does this influence operate: media, personal political connections, organizational connections, etc.?
- d. How direct are policy discussions between manufacturers/vendors and professional educators in the arts concerning mutual cultural and economic issues?

APPENDIX II: STRATEGIES AND TACTICS - AN ANNOTATED OUTLINE

A. ASSESSMENTS

Perhaps the most important aspect of planning is the generation of accurate, realistic assessments. These must be distilled carefully to remove personal bias and localized experience so that a realistic base for action can be formulated. The best operational technique will be ineffective if assessments are not accurate.

1. Certification Issues and Their Relative Importance

As a starting point, use Part I as a guide and identify the specific issues which directly affect art education certification policy. List these in order of importance.

2. Process and Sequence of Change

Describe the process and schedule by which changes in state certification requirements occur. Identify the current point within this schedule.

If change is in the offing, how much time is available before final decisions will be made? If change is not in the offing, what can be done to preserve any favorable situation or to initiate improvements?

3. Influences and Their Relative Importance

Consider the influences in Part II and Appendix I and determine their relevance to the current situation. Use the assessment questions following each section as the basis of building a framework for thorough analysis. For example:

- (a) Identify the individuals who are exercising great political influence over the important policy issues. They will not always be readily apparent. The most visible people are often "front" men or women. Sometimes fronts recognize their status, sometimes they do not.
- (b) Make a thorough evaluation of concerned organizations both within and outside the field of art education. Decide whether each will be supportive, neutral, or negative concerning your position. Can neutral or negative positions be changed to supportive ones in the time available? Will raising the issue with neutral groups carry the possibility of their becoming negative?

4. Forming A Management Structure

What is the best organizational structure for the management of operational plans — ad hoc or permanent, professional only or combination professional and public members, etc? Take care not to spend time on organizational politics to the exclusion of the job that must be done, especially if the time frame is short. Should the management group exert leadership in a manner which is primarily public or private? See item B.11 below for further information.

5. Summation and Distillation of the Assessment Process

- (a) Based on the assessment, determine possible points of leverage and vulnerability as related to strengths and weaknesses.
- (b) Set priorities with respect to issues, influences, organizations, and individuals.
- (c) Identify make or break variables and assign values to each.
- (d) Develop a schedule for the available time frame. Keep the schedule up-to-date as the basis for operational planning. Some scheduling information will be available in advance, such as hearings. Other information, such as timing of media coverage, will not.

B. OPERATIONAL ELEMENTS

Operational planning questions will be faced at every stage of the certification policy review process. Primarily, these questions involve choosing a basic strategy, developing tactical plans to carry out strategy, formulating an appropriate style or styles, and choosing personnel to carry out tactical plans. The following concepts are presented as possible elements in this process.

1. Testimonial and Operational Policy

In the policy arena it is useful to distinguish between testimonial policies which are statements of belief only, and operational policies which are statements of belief backed by resources, programs, and action commensurate with the level of belief expressed. It is important to make distinctions between testimonial policy and operational policy in the operations of others as well as your own.

In evaluating policy generation activities, it is important to make a judgment as to whether policy generation on a specific issue is primarily testimonial or operational.

The problem comes when testimonial policies are forwarded as a substitute for operational policies. This is a common obfuscation technique of funding entities when funds available are insufficient to develop operational policies, or when it is politically infeasible either to develop operational policies or to ignore an issue.

The successful promulgation of such obfuscation results in three things:

- (a) It divides those who are seeking greater operational effectiveness into those who have accepted testimonial policy as operational policy and those who have not.
- (b) It presents a public image of action to those without expertise to evaluate the arena.
- (c) It postpones real action which can only come through the development of operational policy.

2. Sequential and Cumulative Strategies

(a) Sequential Strategy

Sequential strategy involves ever escalating pressure to achieve specific targeted objectives. When working in a short time frame (as is frequently true in a certification situation) sequential strategy may be the only viable alternative. Sequential strategy requires the delegation of operational control to some central authority which coordinates administrative responsibilities. This entity must then be able to (1) ensure the opportunity for positions to be heard (2) provide means for achieving effective control over a policy development situation.

When the logistic organization is available and the issue simple, sequential strategy can be very effective. Because of its nature, sequential strategy often results in the appearance of a "crusade."

(b) Cumulative Strategy

Cumulative strategy offers an opposite structure. It does not require massive administration and supply needs since principal roles are assigned to small units and/or enterprises. Over time, pieces are brought together with a certain result that remains hidden to the casual observer until the point when the aggregation makes major gains apparent.

- (1) A cumulative strategy requires a tremendous amount of disciplined work within small units without the psychological comfort afforded by the conditions of sequential strategy. For example, in cumulative strategy there is no such thing as a series of decisive victories or defeats. There is only the massive improvement of conditions based upon the accumulation of successes by small units or enterprises.
- (2) Cumulative strategy offers several advantages in a situation where work must be done by volunteers. The major advantage is that it leaves each individual or group free from the political problem of being perceived as being "controlled" by the interests of other organizations. The possible disadvantage of cumulative strategy is that it is not loaded with public relations opportunities above the basic operational level.

Cumulative strategy is most often a long-term proposition. When compared to the crusade properties of sequential strategy, cumulative strategy is almost invisible.

3. Style

The style with which any phase of the operation is approached must be considered carefully. Style must not be set by default from the personal styles of the management group or its members. The effect of specific individual and group styles on specific audiences must be considered carefully as part of operational planning.

4. Images of Power Versus Real Power

Assessment will have revealed these distinctions among the constituencies concerned with the issue. It is vital to maintain recognition of these distinctions in all phases of operations. Failure to do so will make the operation vulnerable and jeopardize its chances for success.

5. Information and Involvement for the Basic Constituency

It is essential to keep the basic constituency informed and involved in the operation, with an understanding of its operational strategies. Failure to do so invites divide and conquer tactics which are basic to the technique of master politicians.

6. Dealing with the "Special Interest" Label

The common philosophical argument used to counter a proposal for art articulated by professionals in the visual arts will be that it represents a "special interest." This must be countered as much as possible by broadening the operational base to include and perhaps focus on other community influences.

The assessment phase should have identified individuals and groups who are the most trustworthy, important, and effective in giving assistance. Following the establishment of working relationships, each strategic and tactical decision should consider the effect of these involvements on the avoidance of "special interest" image development.

7. Propaganda Technique

Propaganda technique should be studied in order to recognize its use by the opposition and in the political process. In using propaganda technique, care must be taken that an issue not be raised unless there is some assurance of controlling the direction of the solution. For example, it is possible to generate public awareness that art content is being taken out of teacher education curricula and generate a public response of "that's what we want" unless careful preparations are made.

8. Propaganda Analysis and Operational Planning

In dealing with propaganda in operational terms it is important to make an evaluation about two important phases of propaganda and the timing of the shift between them.

(a) Agitation Propaganda

In the first phase, focus is on agitation propaganda. The goal in this phase is to develop and maintain awareness of a problem, to create tension which calls for some kind of resolution. Many individuals are not that uncomfortable with conditions which are evident in the agitation propaganda phase because its outward manifestations resemble free debate.

(b) Integration Propaganda

The agitation propaganda phase has been successful, tension has been heightened, and issues and conditions have been raised to the level of crisis. At this point, the agitation phase cannot continue without adverse political ramifications. Massive solutions are proposed; master plans which coerce and change are instituted

rapidly to control the crisis. Those who may be adversely affected sense that they have lost influence over policy, and that under the new conditions they have no basis for argument, no grounds for redress, no freedom of action.

Once decisions have been made in this very brief time span, the phase of integration propaganda sets in and continues indefinitely. Therefore, the actual decision-making stage is but a momentary bridge between the agitation and integration propaganda phases.

Obviously, it is easier to be effective in opposing arguments during early stages of the agitation propaganda phase. Prevention of crisis formation is essential if the short-term decision phase is to be avoided.

9. Assessing Community "Involvement" Techniques

Activity which includes "the community" may provide genuine involvement, "window dressing," or "red herrings." The assessment process should reveal whether community involvement techniques such as planning committees, testimony opportunities, etc., are (a) avenues for serious discussion of basic policy, (b) mechanisms for keeping the general situation under control and maintaining a balance among various factions, while at the same time conducting an active policy on behalf of this or that segment of the community, or (c) provision of diversions which obscure the actual policy-making process.

After an assessment of involvement techniques has been made, tactical plans must be prepared for dealing with each situation according to its potential for influencing the outcome. Not all hearings and committees are equally important and should not be treated as such. While all such activities should be monitored, primary focus should be placed on those which are judged to affect policy development outcomes.

10. Targeting the Right People

One of the hardest but most important operational tasks is locating and gaining access to those usually invisible people who have real power and influence over the outcome of events. This alone is often not enough to achieve one's objective, but very often it is the final element in a long process of preparation. It can be the crucial difference.

Equally important is knowing and influencing those whose thoughts and ideas are important to the "right people." Cumulative strategy can be very important here, operating within a small scale of influence.

11. Diffusion of Leadership

In some cases a personality or group has become so ingrained in the life of a state that these individuals can be involved in personality based leadership roles which are effective in the policy generation process.

Although such a leadership style is highly effective in certain situations, in most cases the more publicly defined the leadership, the more ripe for isolation from effectiveness the individual or group becomes. It is too easy for the opposition to deal with issues as the "hobby horses" of individuals and small groups and to target obvious leaders for phony policy involvement which can vitiate their roles and, by extension, the effectiveness of the efforts which they lead.

Whenever possible, distinction should be made between the roles of individuals serving in management and those of individuals serving in public relations. Quiet team effort based on valid assessments generally produces more than ego-based sound and fury with no real power behind it.

12. Laying the Groundwork for the Next Round

All planning should be made with serious consideration for the future when the same issues, perhaps in different forms, will rise again. Strategies and tactics which remove the basis for future negotiation or effectiveness in personal organizational or philosophical terms are to be avoided.

APPENDIX III

SAMPLE BASIC OPERATIONAL PLAN: STAGES LEADING TO REVISED TEACHER CERTIFICATION REQUIREMENTS

The following presents the stages of one of many possible operational plans. This plan includes a broadening of the operational base to include a wide variety of professional and community groups and suggests continuing involvement beyond the final decision on specific state certification requirements.

The Task Force encourages each state group to develop its own operational plan without following any preconceived method. Therefore, the following is presented as an example for study, not as a check-list for replication.

STAGE ONE: ASSESSMENTS AND ALLIANCES

A. Assessments

Consider the NASAD annotated outlines, especially Appendix I and Appendix II A.

B. Alliances

Consider the following potential alliances based upon thorough assessments.

1. Higher Education

- a. Visual arts administrators and art education faculty at public and private two- and four-year institutions.
- b. Administrators and faculty in the fields of teacher education and liberal arts.
- c. College presidents and other general administrators, members of college boards and trustees.
- 2. State Art Teacher Organizations
- 3. State Department of Education
 - a. Art and fine arts state supervisors.
 - b. Other key management and technical personnel.

- 4. State education organizations in other fields with similar training programs and concerns; for example, music, dance, theatre, physical education.
- 5. Local and regional individuals and groups in the state interested in teacher preparation in the fine and applied arts.
 - a. State legislators.
 - b. Members of state and local boards of education.
 - c. Members of committees working under the State Department of Education involved in developing new teacher education guidelines.
 - d. Individuals and groups in media, fine arts, and professional visual arts presentation organizations.

STAGE TWO: OPERATIONAL ELEMENTS DURING THE POLICY DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

Use Appendix II B. of the NASAD annotated outlines as a reference.

It is essential that the operational phase include constant monitoring of (a) the condition of alliances, (b) the activities of individuals and groups directly involved in the policy-making process, (c) the positions of those in the system who will eventually implement state certification policies.

Strategies and tactics should include:

- A. Placing an art/design educator or fine arts representative on the teacher certification visiting team who supports strong visual arts requirements and who can be trusted to maintain his or her position in the course of debate.
- B. Organizing comprehensive press coverage on issues relating to the cultural impact of undesirable requirements by focusing on editorial page material rather than public relations material.
- C. Developing a speakers bureau for civic clubs and parents groups.

STAGE THREE: IMPLEMENTATION OF NEW TEACHER CERTIFICATION STANDARDS

- A. At each postsecondary institution art education faculty should be included on committees involved in developing revised teacher education programs to meet revised certification requirements.
- B. Art education representatives knowledgeable and involved in stages one and two should serve on review teams for the State Department of Education in order to assist in obtaining the most usable art education program possible for the institution.

STAGE FOUR: LAYING THE GROUNDWORK FOR THE FUTURE

Some organization or organizational structure should continue monitoring current situations and preparing for the next round of events leading to future revision of teacher certification guidelines.